



Universidad Nacional de Catamarca - Facultad de Humanidades
Instituto de Investigación en Teorías del Arte y Estética
Revista Rigel – ISSN 2525-1945.

The Dialectic of Identity Between Self and Other: A Comparative Philosophical and Critical Study in Contemporary Western and Arab Thought

Dr. Benbakreti Mohamed

Department of Arts, Djillali Liabes University, Sidi Bel Abbes

Email: benbakretimed@yahoo.fr

Abstract:

This comprehensive study addresses the problematic of identity as a dynamic, relational space forged in the transitional zone between the individual 'Self' (I) and the societal and civilizational 'Other'. The paper begins by deconstructing the concept linguistically and philosophically, subsequently presenting a critical examination of Western philosophical trajectories that sought to establish the foundation of personal identity: starting with sensory consciousness and memory in John Locke, moving through Arthur Schopenhauer's critique and his grounding of identity in the principle of the immutable 'Will and Character', Jules Lachelier's thesis on the unity of temperament and memory, and culminating in Paul Ricoeur's dual narrative and dialectical model of identity (sameness/Idem and selfhood/Ipse). Furthermore, the study explores sociological and cosmic dimensions through Edgar Morin's theory of complex human and social identity, alongside the crisis of cultural clashes and cosmic identity revival in Samuel Huntington's thought. In its second part, the study devotes extensive analysis to the identity crisis in contemporary Arab thought across three fundamental pillars: deconstructing the dialectic of Arabism and Islam and the pivotal question of the 'Era of Codification' (Asr al-Tadwin) by Mohammed Abed al-Jabri, Edward Said's critique of Orientalist representations and the reduction of the Other, and Malek Bennabi's civilizational project rooted in revitalizing the 'Authentic Religious Idea', eradicating 'colonizability' (la colonisabilité), and transitioning from the realm of persons and things to the realm of ideas.

Keywords: Identity, Self and Other, Consciousness and Memory, Orientalism, Cultural Identity, Malek Bennabi, Mohammed Abed al-Jabri, Paul Ricoeur, Edgar Morin, Samuel Huntington.

General Introduction and Framing of the Problematic



Since the dawn of human history, human thought has known an abundance of myths, investigations, and philosophical reflections attempting to elucidate human beginnings and humanity's station in the universe. While celestial religions, foremost among them the Holy Qur'an, established the fundamental truth of the singular origin of humanity descending from Adam and Eve, the historical course of human association rapidly evolved into a complex matrix of distinctions and divergences. Ever since his emergence on Earth, man has engaged in a relentless struggle to construct his personality and identity through active engagement with his natural and social environment, anchored upon a triad of instinct, emotion, and rationality.

This evolutionary development resulted in the division of the world into diverse peoples and nations (Arabs and non-Arabs, Asians, Europeans, and Africans), who differed in their modes of living, patterns of thought, languages, and complexions despite sharing a singular ancestral origin. From this differentiation arose fundamental and pressing questions: Who is that individual? What is that collectivity? How are the contours of that culture demarcated?

The paradox of identity manifests clearly in the answers provided to these inquiries. An individual may define an internal self-image (self-declared identity), or receive definition through social counterparts (identity declared by the Other). Here, profound existential questions emerge: Am I truly as I feel and perceive myself—a unique, independent, and stable entity in my individuality? Or am I merely the artifact of how others perceive me, while my own self-feeling remains subject to change? Or is my self-awareness ultimately the product of enduring negotiations within the web of social relations?

"The identity of an individual, group, or culture lies in the transitional space between the individual and society; for identity is not necessarily that which remains identical, but rather the outcome of an identification resulting from a dual linguistic and cultural process: differentiation and generalization. The first aims at defining the distinction that achieves the uniqueness of an entity or person compared to another, while the second attempts to define what is shared within a category of elements. Identity is shared belonging. These two operations constitute the foundation of the paradox of identity, which cannot be comprehended without considering their common element: identification with the Other and identification through the Other."

This comprehensive study seeks to approach the problematic of identity through two integrated levels: the theoretical philosophical level, which probed the depths of the Self, consciousness, and the Other in Western thought; and the civilizational-cultural level, which pre-occupied contemporary Arab and Islamic thought amidst its struggle against hegemony and alienation, and in its quest for the conditions of renaissance and intellectual autonomy.

I. Conceptual and Linguistic Foundations (Identity, Self, Other)

1. Semantic and Terminological Demarcation of Identity

In modern Western and Latin languages, the term (Identité, Identity, Identitas) derives from the Latin root (Idem), which signifies sameness, selfhood, and belonging to a collective that endows the individual with distinct characteristics.

In Arabic philosophical lexicography, the term 'al-Huwiyyah' (identity) does not originate from a traditional triliteral verbal root, but was coined by early Arab translators from the third-person singular pronoun 'Huwa' (He/It), indicating the essential connection between subject and predicate in its permanent core. Al-Farabi elaborated substantially upon this concept, asserting that identity expresses the essence of a thing, its individuation, distinctiveness, singularity, and independent existence wherein no other shares. Classical philosophers distinguished between three interrelated dimensions:

- Truth / Reality (al-Haqiqah): That which makes a thing 'what it is' in terms of its actualization and reality.
- Identity (al-Huwiyyah): That which makes a thing singular and distinct in terms of its individuation and specific manifestation.
- Essence / Quiddity (al-Mahiyyah): That which is comprehended of a thing when considered in its most universal and abstract sense.

Terminologically, the foundational definition traces back to Book IV of Aristotle's *Metaphysics*, wherein identity is defined as 'the oneness of being'—whether the existence of a single thing in itself, or of multiple things treated as one in essence, species, or number.

In contemporary scholarship, French thinker Alex Mucchielli proposes a composite definition wherein identity is regarded as an integrated dynamic system comprising physical, psychological, moral, and social elements operating within a matrix of cognitive integration. The unity of identity manifests in internal affective coherence and the harmony between continuity and distinctiveness, conferring upon the person a genuine differentiation from others and reinforcing their subjective uniqueness.

2. The Concept of the 'Self' (I / Ego): Between Philosophical Consciousness, Psychoanalysis, and Existentialism

Linguistically, the term 'al-Ana' (Moi, Je - Ego - Self) denotes the singular first-person nominative pronoun. In Arab and Islamic philosophical thought, the 'Self' signified the conscious perceiving soul distinct from the physical body. As Ibn Sina (Avicenna) famously posited: «By the soul is meant that to which each individual refers by saying: 'I'... The human being who refers to himself as 'I' is distinct from the totality of his bodily parts; it is something beyond the physical frame». Ibn Sina demonstrated this by arguing that even if a person's physical limbs were altered or stripped away, his conviction that he remains 'himself' persists unabated.

Nevertheless, the individual Ego does not originate in an abstract vacuum. Since the dawn of humanity, no identity of the 'I' existed without the identity of the 'We'. Early humans lived within nomadic tribes and ethnic collectivities wherein individual selfhood was thoroughly

immersed in collective identity bound by ties of blood, language, religion, and customary practices.

In psychoanalysis, Sigmund Freud formulated the structure of the Ego (das Ich) as an intermediary construct emerging from the perceptual-sensory apparatus, situated at the boundary between consciousness and the unconscious ('the Id' / das Es). The Ego represents the conscious surface tasked with reality adaptation and regulating instinctual drives.

In existential philosophy with Jean-Paul Sartre, the Self transcends biological and deterministic confines to become a free project perpetually open to becoming and nothingness: the 'I' that I am now depends upon the 'I' that I am not yet. Human nature is forged through present actions and future choices; man is the author of his essence and bears total responsibility for his existence.

3. The 'Other' in Contemporary Philosophy: From the Negation of the Self to the Condition of Its Existence

The 'Other' is defined in its most elemental sense as the antithesis of the 'Self' or 'Subject'. This concept attained paramount significance in contemporary French philosophy (Jean-Paul Sartre, Michel Foucault, Jacques Lacan, Emmanuel Levinas). The Other is no longer merely the foreign or culturally alien, but simultaneously constitutes a vital catalyst for self-consciousness and a perpetual challenge to its sovereign unity.

André Lalande traced this formulation to Plato's dialogue *The Sophist*, wherein the Other is defined as that which is different from Being, thereby establishing the ontological reality of 'Non-Being'.

In Michel Foucault's framework, the Other is inextricably bound to the Self, analogous to the relationship between life and death. Foucault contends—in contrast to Sartre—that when the Subject excludes the Other, it fundamentally excludes humanity itself. The Other represents the 'abyss' and the discursive space within which discourse is generated. In *The Birth of the Clinic*, Foucault illustrates how Western man constituted himself as a subject of scientific inquiry by objectifying and excluding the Other. The Other represents the 'unthought' within the structure of thought itself; just as the present cannot be conceived without the past, the Self cannot be known without the Other.

When the concept of the Other is erected upon cultural essentialism, it transforms into an ideological mechanism of domination, reducing the Other to an inferior entity outside the sphere of civilization—a critical problematic deconstructed by Edward Said in his critique of Orientalism.

II. Trajectories of Personal Identity in Western Philosophy

1. Conscious Continuity and Memory: John Locke

English philosopher John Locke stands as the pioneer of the empiricist approach to personal identity (*An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*, Book II, Chapter 27). Locke begins with the methodological inquiry into what constitutes a 'Person', defining it as: «a thinking intelligent being, that has reason and reflection, and can consider itself as itself, the same thinking thing, in different times and places».

Locke locates the instrument of this continuity in consciousness inseparable from thought. Whenever a human perceives, hears, smells, tastes, or wills, he necessarily knows that he does so at the moment of the act. Because consciousness constantly accompanies thought, and since the mind begins as a *tabula rasa* upon which sensory experience inscribes its impressions, the extension of this conscious awareness backward through memory is the sole foundation of personal identity.

Locke illustrates this via his celebrated thought experiment regarding the Prince and the Cobbler: Should the soul of a prince, carrying the consciousness of his past life, enter the body of a cobbler, everyone would externally perceive him as a cobbler, yet the real person accountable morally and legally for the prince's deeds would be the prince himself. Thus, Locke established the 'Psychological Continuity Theory', making memory the definitive criterion for self-identity.

2. The Critique of Consciousness and the Primacy of the Immutable Will: Arthur Schopenhauer

German philosopher Arthur Schopenhauer formulated a radical critique of Locke's empiricism, maintaining that founding identity upon consciousness, memory, and the body is fundamentally flawed, proceeding through a rigorous threefold critique:

1. Critique of the Physical Body: The substance of the body is not immutable; its matter renews completely over years and its form alters through aging and illness, with the sole exception of the 'expression of the gaze' which hints at an inner core.
2. Critique of Consciousness and Memory: Memory is an unreliable vessel; what man remembers of his past consists merely of fragments, while oblivion swallows the majority of events. Brain injury, sickness, or senescence can obliterate memory entirely without destroying the person's identity. The knowing intellect is merely a cerebral function that sleeps and awakens.
3. The Alternative (The Will): Schopenhauer asserts that that which remains eternally identical with itself, never aging nor succumbing to time, is the Will (the immutable Character). It constitutes the core of existence lying behind the knowing subject, knowing only two fundamental stances: 'to will or not to will'. The Will is the true unchanging anchor of personal identity.

3. Unity of Temperament and Associative Memory: Jules Lachelier

Within French philosophy, Jules Lachelier rejected the premise of an abstract, primordial metaphysical 'Ego' preceding experience. He substantiated this through empirical psychological phenomena: the sleeping subject possesses an imaginary self that vanishes upon waking;

cerebral trauma creates a total rupture between the self of today and yesterday; and dissociative personality disorder exhibits alternating selves.

Lachelier concluded that our sense of internal personal identity rests exclusively upon two interrelated factors:

- Continuity of Temperament and Disposition: The consistent psychological and moral traits governing how an individual reacts to external stimuli.
- Interconnection of Memories: The backward reach of memory linking present states to past perceptions, rendering identity a continuous echo of past impressions within present awareness, such that we are merely phenomena that remember one another.

Psychological State / Example	Philosophical Interpretation	Characteristics of the Self	Epistemological Conclusion
The Sleeping Person	Possession of identity despite absence of waking sensory awareness	Imaginary self vanishing upon waking	Transitory sensory consciousness is not the essence of identity
Head Trauma / Cerebral Shock	Rupture between the self of today and yesterday; memory loss	Initial self versus subsequent self	Abstract ego alone cannot maintain temporal continuity
Dissociative Identity (Split Self)	Alternation of multiple states within the same biological frame	Multiplicity and duality of the self	Rejection of an a priori, unitary, metaphysical Ego
Consistency of Moral Reactions	Distinctive stability of psychological and behavioral responses	Unity of personal temperament and disposition	Identity is the continuity of temperament and the network of memories

4. The Dialectic of Sameness and Selfhood: Paul Ricœur

French philosopher Paul Ricœur introduced a transformative synthesis in his seminal work *Oneself as Another* (*Soi-même comme un autre*). Moving beyond static substantialist paradigms, Ricœur argued that the past does not dictate a closed determinism; rather, our present actively reinterprets, narrates, and assigns meaning to the past.

Ricœur meticulously distinguished between two fundamental poles of identity based on the criterion of 'permanence in time':

1. Sameness (Mêmeté / Idem): Refers to numerical identity and uninterrupted structural permanence across time (what remains the same, such as the physical continuity of minerals or the organic development of a seed into a tree without invoking a substantialist core).
2. Selfhood (Ipséité / Soi): Refers to narrative, flexible identity characterizing an agent capable of designating himself as the author of his words and actions, maintaining moral responsibility and keeping promises across temporal shifts.

Through this synthesis, Ricoeur established the ethical and intersubjective dimension of identity: selfhood is fulfilled only through the Other, wherein 'living well with and for others in just institutions' becomes the cornerstone of self-esteem and mutual recognition.

III. Sociological and Geopolitical Dimensions of Identity

1. Complex Thought and Universal Human Identity: Edgar Morin

In his monumental project *Method: Humanity of Humanity - Human Identity*, French thinker Edgar Morin articulated a framework grounded in complexity theory, transcending narrow positivist and structuralist reductions. Morin delineated three interconnected tiers of identity:

- Universal Human Identity: The unity of the human species grounded in a shared genetic heritage and the identical organizational architecture of the human brain, endowing all humans with the universal capacities for consciousness, reflection, and creativity regardless of ethnic or geographical diversity.
- Individual Personal Identity: The singular lived experience of each individual, developing historically from lineage naming ('son of so-and-so') to modern civic and national affiliations.
- Social Identity and the State: The construction of collective identity through social equilibrium and institutional integration into the 'We'. Morin warns against the authoritarian state when its power becomes an internalized 'internal censor' within the Ego, demanding blind subjugation, and advocates for a 'planetary citizenship' fostering human solidarity.

2. The Clash of Civilizations and the Global Identity Crisis: Samuel Huntington

Following the Cold War's conclusion, Francis Fukuyama proclaimed the 'End of History and the Last Man' (1992), asserting the final triumph of liberal democracy. Samuel Huntington countered this thesis in *The Clash of Civilizations* (1993), arguing that history had entered a new phase of cultural and civilizational polarization.

Huntington posited that global politics is now reconfigured along cultural and religious axes; the quintessential question is no longer 'Which ideology do you support?', but the existential query: 'Who are you? Who are we?'. He categorized identity determinants into a matrix encompassing: personal attributes (kinship and ethnicity), social environment, culture (language and religion), territoriality, politics, and economics.

Huntington warned of the explosion of a 'Global Identity Crisis' affecting nations such as the United States, Russia, Algeria, Canada, and Iran. Under the pressures of alienation and

globalization, individuals retreat into narrow sub-identities, giving rise to 'herd identity', which suppresses internal pluralism and derives its cohesion solely from antagonism toward the 'Other'.

IV. The Predicament of Identity in Contemporary Arab and Islamic Thought

Contemporary Arab thought since the Nahda (Renaissance) has endured a profound struggle to articulate identity and overcome the legacies of underdevelopment and colonization, oscillating between sharp dichotomies: (Authenticity vs. Modernity, Heritage vs. Innovation, The Self vs. The West, Religion vs. State). The human condition is unique in that identity turns into alienation when a schism arises between what is and what ought to be.

1. Deconstructing the Dialectic of Arabism and Islam and the Question of Codification: Mohammed Abed al-Jabri

Moroccan philosopher Mohammed Abed al-Jabri occupies a preeminent position in critiquing the Arab mind. He addressed the central problematic: «Which represents the primary determinant of identity in this region: Arabism or Islam? Is Arabism first, or Islam first?».

In *Issues in Contemporary Arab Thought*, al-Jabri demonstrated that Arab culture did not originate solely in the pre-Islamic Jahiliyyah, which was merely an extension of an ancient civilizational matrix (Sumerian, Phoenician, Pharaonic, Syriac, and Amazigh). Rather, the definitive systemic foundation of Arab-Islamic culture occurred during the **Era of Codification (Asr al-Tadwin)** in the mid-second century Hijri.

The Era of Codification accomplished pivotal civilizational transformations:

- Standardization of the Arabic Language: Elevating Arabic from oral Bedouin usage into a systematic language of scientific inquiry and conceptualization.
- Codification of Islamic Sciences: Comprehensive compilation of Quranic exegesis, Hadith, jurisprudence, and theology.
- Assimilation of Universal Heritage: Translating and synthesizing Greek, Persian, and Indian sciences into the fabric of Islamic culture.

Al-Jabri concluded that Arabism and Islam are not antagonistic opposites, but complementary components forming the historical reference frame of the nation. Future revival demands a critical deconstruction of polarized dichotomies to liberate Arab thought from European Orientalist hegemony, which historically enacted geographic, racial, civilizational, and intellectual exclusion against the East.

2. Critique of Orientalism and the Affirmation of Plural Identity: Edward Said

Drawing upon his lived experience of exile and the watershed moments of 1967 and 1973, Palestinian scholar Edward Said revealed in *Orientalism* (1978) how Western imperial discourse constructed an epistemic apparatus reducing the Orient and Arabs to homogeneous, exotic, and irrational stereotypes designed to justify domination.

Said dismantled these reductions by highlighting the immense geographical, linguistic, and cultural pluralism within the Arab world, encompassing Mashriqi, Maghrebi, Pharaonic, Amazigh, and African dimensions. He identified the **Arabic language** as one of the supreme intellectual architectures of humanity—the medium of the Qur'an, philosophy, mysticism, the narratives of One Thousand and One Nights and Ibn Battuta's travels, and monuments of architectural brilliance such as circular Baghdad and Andalusian palaces.

Said underscored the indispensable role of the public intellectual, writer, and artist in defending cultural identity and resisting ideological censorship and authoritarianism, affirming that literature and art represent vital arenas for human emancipation and democratic freedom against imperial hegemony.

3. Conditions of the Renaissance and Eradicating 'Colonizability': Malek Bennabi

Algerian thinker Malek Bennabi provided a rigorous sociological and civilizational analysis of the Islamic world's malaise. Reformulating Shakib Arslan's famous question: «Why did Muslims regress while others progressed?», Bennabi asserted that the crisis of identity is fundamentally a **'problem of civilization'**.

A. The Equation of Civilization and the Role of the Religious Idea:

Civilization Equation: Civilization = Man + Soil + Time.
Problem of Civilization = Problem of Man + Problem of Soil + Problem of Time.

Employing a chemical analogy (the reaction of hydrogen and oxygen to produce water), Bennabi argued that merely accumulating these three elements cannot yield civilization. Soil remains barren, man inert, and time squandered unless catalyzed by a spiritual synthesis: **the Authentic Religious Idea** (as manifested in the revelatory word 'Iqra' / Read, which galvanized the Arab tribes into historical dynamism).

B. Deconstructing 'Colonizability' (La Colonisabilité) and Social Stages:

Bennabi categorized the civilizational cycle into three stages: Pre-Civilization, Civilization, and Post-Civilization. He diagnosed contemporary Muslim societies as languishing in the 'Post-Civilization' stage, having lost their original spiritual and intellectual vitality.

Here, Bennabi introduced his groundbreaking concept of **'Colonizability'** (al-Qabiliyyah lil-Isti'mar). Western colonialism could not have imposed its dominion over Arab and Muslim lands (as occurred in Algeria and the Levant) without a preexisting internal psychological and intellectual disposition toward subjugation. Hence, genuine emancipation does not begin merely with the military expulsion of the colonizer, but with the eradication of colonizability and the dismantling of 'intellectual idolatry' that substitutes principles with personality cults.

C. Transitioning from the Realm of Things to the Realm of Ideas:

Bennabi conceptualized society as operating across three realms: the Realm of Persons, the Realm of Things, and the Realm of Ideas. Underdeveloped societies suffer from a chronic

'deficiency of ideas', drowning in the passive material accumulation ('thing-ification') of Western commodities without possessing the directing ideas.

To achieve authentic renaissance, Bennabi mandated a ****Dual Operation****:

1. Negative Operation: A resolute break from the decadent residues and fatalism of the era of decline.
2. Positive Operation: A purposeful orientation toward future imperatives, drawing upon pristine Quranic principles to activate the mind, discipline time, and cultivate the conscious agent.

Conclusion and Research Findings

This comparative critical study reaches the following overarching conclusions:

- The Dynamism of Identity: Identity is neither a closed, immutable essence nor a passive genetic inheritance; it is a relational continuum forged in the transitional space between self-differentiation and collective belonging.
- Equilibrium Between the Constant and the Variable: Living identity thrives upon a creative equilibrium between the **Constant** (the religious, linguistic, and ethical foundational values of the nation) and the **Variable** (scientific progress, technological acquisition, and evolving cultural expressions).
- Transcending Sterile Polarities: Overcoming the contemporary Arab identity crisis cannot occur through insular traditionalist withdrawal nor through uncritical Western assimilation, but through cultivating ****endogenous civilizational efficacy****—in Bennabi's terms—that dismantles dependency, champions intellectual freedom, and contributes actively to universal human civilization.

List of References and Sources

1. Aristotle: *Metaphysics* (Book IV), translated and edited by W. D. Ross / Arabic edition by Ahmed Fouad al-Ahwani, Dar Ihya al-Kutub al-Arabiyyah, Cairo.
2. Alex Mucchielli: *L'Identité* (Identity: Studies in Interaction and Human Behavior), translated by Ali Watfa, Dar al-Ma'aref.
3. Edgar Morin: *La Méthode: L'Humanité de l'humanité - L'Identité humaine* (Method: The Humanity of Humanity - Human Identity), translated by Hanaa Sobhi, Kalima, Abu Dhabi.
4. Edward W. Said: *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient*, translated by Mohamed Enani, Roeyah Publishing, Cairo / Pantheon Books, New York.
5. Edward W. Said: *Culture and Imperialism*, translated by Kamal Abu Deeb, Dar al-Adab, Beirut / Vintage Books, New York.

6. Paul Ricoeur: *Soi-même comme un autre* (Oneself as Another), translated by George Zenati, Arab Organization for Translation, Centre for Arab Unity Studies, Beirut / University of Chicago Press.
7. John Locke: *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding* (Book II, Chapter 27: 'Of Identity and Diversity'), translated by Adel Mostafa, Roeyah Publishing, Cairo.
8. Jules Lachelier: *Psychologie et principes de l'identité* (Psychology and the Principles of Identity), French Classical Philosophical Studies, Paris.
9. Samuel P. Huntington: *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, translated by Talaat al-Shayeb, Sutoor Publishing, Cairo / Simon & Schuster, New York.
10. Francis Fukuyama: *The End of History and the Last Man*, translated by Fouad Sharaqi, Al-Ahram Translation Center, Cairo / Free Press, New York.
11. Malek Bennabi: *Les Conditions de la renaissance* (Conditions of the Renaissance), translated by Omar Meskawi and Abdel-Sabour Shahin, Dar al-Fikr, Damascus.
12. Malek Bennabi: *Le Problème des idées dans le monde musulman* (The Problem of Ideas in the Muslim World), Dar al-Fikr al-Mu'asir, Beirut - Damascus.
13. Malek Bennabi: *Le Problème de la culture* (The Problem of Culture), Dar al-Fikr, Damascus.
14. Malek Bennabi: *The Reality and Position of the Islamic Nation in the World*, Intellectual Lectures Series, Dar al-Fikr, 1970.
15. Mohammed Abed al-Jabri: *Issues in Contemporary Arab Thought* (Ishkaliyyat al-Fikr al-Arabi al-Mu'asir), Centre for Arab Unity Studies, Beirut.
16. Mohammed Abed al-Jabri: *The Formation of Arab Reason* (Takwin al-Aql al-Arabi - Critique of Arab Reason 1), Centre for Arab Unity Studies, Beirut.
17. Arthur Schopenhauer: *The World as Will and Representation* (Vol. II), translated by Ahmed Khaki, Dar al-Ma'aref, Cairo / Dover Publications.
18. Jamil Saliba: *The Philosophical Dictionary* (Al-Mu'jam al-Falsafi), Parts 1 & 2, Dar al-Kitab al-Lubnani, Beirut.